

**Palm Beach County HIV CARE Council**  
**CARE Council Meeting**  
*Monday, February 24, 2020*

**Minutes**

**Members Present**

Ashnika Ali  
Lilia Perez  
Kim Enright  
Lysette Perez  
Kristen Harrington  
Damion Baker  
Quinton Dames  
Glenn Krabec  
David Shamer  
Kathlyn Belizaire  
Hector Bernardino  
Eileen Perry  
Mark White  
Cecil Smith  
Chris Dowden  
Kristina Rowe  
Thomas McKissack

**Members Absent**

\*Dale Smith  
Vickie Rossy  
\*Felisha Douglas-Bowman  
\* Mary Jane Reynolds

**CARE Council Staff**

Neeta Mahani  
Shirley White

**Guests**

Tyrina Pinkney  
Marie Presmy  
Robert Aguero  
Anil Pandya  
Heath Bish  
Rob Scott  
Anne Costello  
Quasia Cowan  
Chris L.  
Marvin A. Poole  
Skyler King

**Grantee Staff**

Shoshana Ringer  
Shirley Lanier  
Helen Hvizd  
Anna Balla  
Daisy Wiebe  
Casey Messer  
Maria Corona  
Juliane Tran  
Thomas Eaton

**Guests**

Vince Hodge  
Denise Brown  
Stephanie Thomas  
Julia Hawly  
Kathryn Mathieu  
Brittany McClure  
Andrea Stubbs  
Wismy Cius  
Cathy Mulcahey

\*Denotes an excused absence

---

I. The CARE Council Meeting was called to order at 2:06p.m. by the Chair, Christopher Dowden at the Mayme Frederick Building. Roll was taken; **a quorum was present**. Guests were introduced.

II. A Moment of Reflection:

**Moment of Silence**

*A moment of silence is observed in respect to the memory of those individuals who have succumbed to AIDS and those who are living with the disease. Let us remember why we are here today. Let us have the strength to make the decisions that will improve the care of those we serve. Let us be thankful for what we have accomplished to date.*

***“In Remembrance of Shirley Samples”***

III. **Motion** by Glenn Krabec, **second** by Kristina Rowe to accept the excused absence of Mary Jane Reynolds, Felisha Douglas, Dale Smith for today, and Thomas McKissack on January 27, 2020.  
**Motion carried.**

- IV. Motion** by Glenn Krabec, **second** by Thomas McKissack to accept the February 24, 2020 CARE Council Meeting Agenda as amended. **Motion carried.**
- V. Motion** by David Shamer, **second** by Lysette Perez to accept the January 27, 2020 CARE Council Meeting Minutes as presented. **Motion** by Kim Enright, **second** by Lysette Perez to table the motion to approved the January 27, 2020 CARE Council meeting minutes to include mention of the lengthy conversation in reference to housing. **Motion carried.**
- VI. Comments by the Chair:** The Chair informed everyone of the CARE Council Meeting Binders that is available to be used for reference during meetings. He said that today we are going to be voting on some motions from the Priorities and Allocations committee. He reviewed the rules and laws on voting conflicts. He said members are reminded that voting conflicts should be determined by reference to section 112.3143 Florida Statutes and Sec. 2-443(c) of the Palm Beach County Code of Ethics. He read each into the record and then stated therefore any CARE Council member who is employed by a sub-recipient that provide services in a core or support category that will increase or decrease in funding amount pursuant to the motion under consideration should generally abstain from discussing and voting on the motion. CARE Council members are responsible for determining whether and when a voting conflict exists as to themselves since members are individually responsible for any violation of the state ethics rules. The reason he underlined the voting conflict laws is to prevent an advisory board member who stands to gain or loss by the vote to influencing other members in their consideration and vote. For the same reason he is exercising his discretion as the Chair of this meeting to allow public comment during consideration of allocation/reallocation matters but only by individuals who are not employed by sub-recipients who are required to abstain from discussion and voting at this meeting. Also, the public comment section of the meeting, which will come after his section, is of course open to anybody that would like to make any statement that they feel is necessary. He asked everybody to be respectful and raise his or her hand to be acknowledge. If you have questions or need information to understand the motion please say so, it's okay to ask questions during the meeting. He said he would also like to remind that the recipient office is not making recommendations. They are providing us with information that we need to make a decision. This council is tasked with prioritizing categories and allocating funds. The recipient's office cannot allocate or reallocate funds between service categories without our approval. He asked that everybody remember that when viewing the information in front of them and make sure they are viewing it in the proper context. We need to evaluation this information and use it to make our decision.
- VII. Public Comments:** Stephanie Thomas requested that a resource directory be created for each service category and what facilities are providing that service for the general public to be published on a website. There was mention of the Redbook, but it is not updated. The service categories are on the website but not agency specific, but would be for 2020.

Marie Presmy commented that there is a lot of discussion about how case management is not a valuable service any more. She stated that as a former case manager 25/23 years ago. The reason the community right now is stable is because of their work as case managers. She said that she is not opposed to change but it pains her to hear that they are doing a disservice to the community when we are funding case managers. She said we do not have a vending machine for clients to use, it's not a self-service, they have to go to a case manager to access every single service they need. During the last open enrollment, their case managers enrolled 175 clients into health insurance; they worked overtime and on Saturday's to do it.

Anil Pandya stated there's a meeting he attended last week that he left very disturbed. He said it wasn't because he was personally offended on behalf of an agency or some sort of financial gain or loss. He was disturb at what he saw. We start every meeting by talking about having the strength to make the best decisions on behalf of people living with HIV. And he left that meeting with a feeling of disgust and feeling disturbed because he knew that that was not what had occurred. He made it clear in the meeting as best as he could the rules that we have in place with abstentions and so forth. He said that we would not being hearing much from him in the meeting today. But, as a member during this public comment he wanted to implore the group on any decision that we make today, tomorrow, in the committee, in the main body, anything that's going to affect the lives of the people living with HIV, please take the to listen to all of the facts that are being presented. If facts are not being presented, ask second level, third level questions. Take the time, if you someone is saying you are running out of time, ask for a little more time. These are important decisions because what happened in this meeting after it was all said and done and the decisions were made, we started to hear from several members that they didn't fully understand what I just voted for. And that's unacceptable, that's not the kind of community we strive for. He asks that all the members here who have the power today, listen, understand, and vote with your conscience and vote with what you know is right and ask yourself, is what I'm deciding going to help people living with HIV or is it going to help enrich individuals or agencies. If we are voting with the community then we are going to be on the right side every single time.

- VIII. Educational Moment:** Kim Rommel-Enright – LGBTQ Health Equity Survey Results: Kim ask that she present at the next meeting.

Eileen Perry requested that there be a communication process for staff when they are out.

- IX. Unfinished Business and General Orders:** There was none.

**X. New Business:**

**A. Vote: Approval of Committee Recommendations:**

1. Kim Rommel-Enright – Legal Aid Society of PBC (LAS), Ashnika Ali – Health Council of Southeast Florida (HCSEF), Lysette Perez – Compass, Inc., Kristen Harrington – AIDS Healthcare Foundation (AHF), Kristina Rowe – Legal Aid Society of PBC (LAS), Lilia Perez – FoundCare, and Quinton Dames –FoundCare abstained.

**Motion carried** to approve the Priorities and Allocations Committee’s recommendation to move \$30,000 from Legal Services and put it into Health Insurance Premium & Cost Sharing Assistance.

2. Ashnika Ali – HCSEF, Lysette Perez – Compass, Kristen Harrington – AHF, Hector Bernardino – Florida Department of Health (FDOH), Lilia Perez – FoundCare, and Quinton Dames – FoundCare abstained.

**Motion failed** to approve the Priorities and Allocations Committee’s recommendation to move \$20,000 from Medical Transportation and \$10,000 from Emergency Financial Assistance – Prior Authorization (EFA-PA) for a total of \$30,000 into Medical Case Management. Hand count 6 Nay/5 Aye.

3. Ashnika Ali – HCSEF, Lysette Perez – Compass, Kristen Harrington – AHF, Hector Bernardino – FDOH, Lilia Perez – FoundCare, and Quinton Dames – FoundCare abstained.

**Motion carried** to approve the Priorities and Allocations Committee’s recommendation to move \$20,000 from Medical Transportation and \$12,000 from Emergency Financial Assistance – Prior Authorization for a total of \$32,000 into Non-Medical Case Management – Eligibility. There was 1 opposition.

4. Ashnika Ali – HCSEF, Lilia Perez – FoundCare, and Quinton Dames – FoundCare abstained.

**Motion carried** to approved the Priorities and Allocations Committee’s recommendation for the Minority AIDS Initiative reduce Early Intervention Services by \$1270, Medical Case Management by \$1270, Non-Medical Case Management by \$1270, and Psychosocial Support Services by \$1269.

5. **Motion carried** to approve the Priorities and Allocation Committee’s recommendation for the Minority AIDS Initiative that 100% of the funds under Psychosocial Support Services will be reserved for peer navigation services targeted at engagement of Haitian individuals living with HIV.

6. Kim Rommel-Enright – LAS, Ashnika Ali – HCSEF, Kristina Rowe – LAS, Kristen Harrington – AHF, Lysette Perez – Compass, Lilia Perez – FoundCare, and Quinton Dames – FoundCare abstained.

**Motion carried** to approve the Priorities and Allocations Committee’s recommendation to decrease Medical Transportation by \$29,943 and Legal Services by \$46,052.

7. Ashnika Ali – HCSEF, Kristen Harrington – AHF, Lilia Perez – FoundCare, Quinton Dames – FoundCare, and Hector Bernardino – FDOH abstained.

**Motion carried** to approve the Priorities and Allocations Committee’s recommendation to reduce Outpatient/Ambulatory Health Services to \$750,000, Oral Health Care to \$350,000, AIDS Pharmaceutical Assistance to \$15,000, Home & Community Base Health Services to \$5,000 and Medical Nutrition Therapy to \$55,000.

8. Ashnika Ali – HCSEF, Lysette Perez – Compass, Hector Bernardino – FDOH, Lilia Perez – FoundCare, and Quinton Dames – FoundCare abstained.

**Motion carried** to approve the Priorities and Allocations Committee’s recommendation to reduce Non-Medical Case Management by \$46,818 divided evenly \$23,409 from Eligibility and \$23,409 from Supportive.

9. Ashnika Ali – HCSEF, Lysette Perez – Compass, Kristen Harrington – AHF, Damion Baker – Monarch Health Services, Hector Bernardino – FDOH, Quinton Dames – FoundCare, and Lilia Perez – FoundCare abstained.

**Motion carried** to approve the Priorities and Allocations Committee’s recommendation to increase Health Insurance Premium and Cost Sharing by \$76,596.60, Mental Health by \$21, 900, Medical Case Management by \$99,415, and Early Intervention Services by \$45,420.

10. The Bylaws Ad hoc Committee requests to change the name of the LGBTQ Health Equity Committee to LGBTQ+ Health Equity Committee. **Motion** by Kim Enright, second by Glenn Krabec to approve the Bylaws Ad hoc Committee’s request to change the name of the LGBTQ Health Equity Committee to LGBTQ+ Health Equity Committee. **Motion carried.**

11. **Motion** by Glenn Krabec, **second** by David Shamer to approve the Local Pharmaceutical Assistance Program Committee’s request for approval of the Emergency Financial Assistance (EFA) service standards. **Motion carried.** Kristen Harrington – AHF abstained.

12. **Motion** by Glenn Krabec, **second** by Cecil Smith to approve the Local Pharmaceutical Assistance Program Committee’s request for approval of the AIDS Pharmaceutical Assistance service standards. **Motion carried.** Kristen Harrington – AHF abstained.

**B. APA and EFA-PA Service Standards:** See numbers 11 and 12 above.

**C. New Membership Recommendations: Christopher Bish and Richardo Jackson**

**Motion carried** to approve the Membership Committee’s recommendation for approval of Christopher Heath Bish for membership on the CARE Council.

**Motion carried** to approve the Membership Committee’s recommendation for approval of Richardo Jackson for membership on the CARE Council.

**D. Bylaws Committee:** The Bylaws Ad hoc Committee will convene to review the Bylaws and Policies, to discuss and define our process for engaging Council approved members, and voting conflict participation during allocations.

The CARE Council Chair appointed himself, Glenn Krabec, Kristen Harrington, Lysette Perez, Denise Brown, Quasia Cowan, Kristina Rowe, Mary Kannel, Thomas McKissack, and Mary Jane Reynolds as members of the Bylaws Ad hoc Committee.

**XI. Other Business:**

- A. Sub-Recipients’ 10% Discussion:** Lilia Perez asked was the sub-recipients’ discretion to move funds between categories internally taken away, to help the grantee’s office reach the 95% and avoid penalties. The response was, what Lilia is referring to is contractual language, and

is a county authorization. But, the sub-recipients ability to shift funding within contracts of any sub-recipient between categories and there are or could be some provisions that allows that from a county perspective without requiring amendments to contracts with the BCC. Any provision that allows that from a county perspective is still required to adhere to HRSA requirements. Although the county may be okay or allow for sub-recipients to move dollars within a percentage of their award or between categories, HRSA does not allow it. HRSA is very clear in that, if any funding is shifted between categories that has to occur with approval of the CARE Council. That's not something the county has the authority to approve. If there are shifts within a service category between sub-recipients, that is allowed by HRSA at the county level. But, HRSA does not allow the county regardless of contractual language that allows for sub-recipients or the county to move dollars between service categories that is not in alignment or congruence with the allocations recommendations of the CARE Council. Whatever provisions that have been in contract language remain there but they are still required to be in compliance with HRSA's expectation, as well.

It was stated that they've had it for years and this is the first time that it had changed and wanted to bring this to the committee's attention. To avoid those long meetings and for the budget projections as well.

It was stated that this body does not have the authority to recommend or change contractual language that allows something particularly in opposition to what HRSA allows. We want to be flexible but from the day that Dr. Messer got here, he would not allow any activities that is in direct conflict with HRSA requirements. That is his charge as the program administrator for this grant and that's a commitment that he is making.

## **XII. Standing Reports & Updates:**

- A. Legislative Update:** Chris Dowden state he did reach out to some people but did not get a response. He did get some legislative updates through FHAN. He will give them to Neeta to forward out.
- B. CPP Updates:** Rob Scott said the next meeting will be March 20. The agenda will be to approve the bylaws. Stay tune for an email from him regarding a listening session for minority communities, they will be held the same day as CPP around lunchtime.
- C. Part B Report: Patient Care & 4BNWK Report:** Brittany McClure provided the Part B expenditure report.  
**Motion** by Glenn Krabec, **second** by Mark White to extend the meeting 15 minutes. **Motion carried.**
- D. HOPWA:** Mark White informed that the City of West Palm Beach is updating it's 5 year consolidated plan for HUD. They will be seeking public comments on their three federal grants; the website to comment is [WPB.org/HCD](http://WPB.org/HCD). They have an opportunity to apply for extra HOPWA dollars and he will keep the committee updated as they are pursuing more HOPWA money for Palm Beach County.
- E. C.H.A.G. Report:** Denise Brown reported that there is a meeting tomorrow for the statewide consumer advisory group.

- F. Part A:** Dr. Casey Messer stated that the Housing is Healthcare 100-Day Challenge is looking for participation from the CARE Council. The National Ryan White HIV Care and Prevention Conference is in August (8/11 – 8/14) in Washington DC. He said funding has been set aside to support travel for participation in this conference. They are asking the CARE Council to identify a member to represent the CARE Council at this meeting and/or a member of the community to participate in this conference. Chris Dowden and Cecil Smith expressed interest. Glenn Krabec nominated, Lysette Perez second for Chris and Cecil. Neeta will send out an email with information to CARE Council members to see who would be interested. No action taken on the nomination, it will be addressed at the next meeting.
- G. Expenditure Report:** The expenditure report was covered in previous discussions.
- H. LGBTQ:** Kim Enright stated that she would do the presentation at the April meeting. The committee is working on a flyer/brochure, LGBTQ 101, to provide more information regarding health equity issues. The CARE Council will participate in the Pride and need people at the table and in the parade.
- I. LPAP:** The committee chair and vice chair has been out. Neeta have tried making contact with both, if there is no response from the vice chair by Wednesday, the CARE Council chair stated that he would appoint a vice chair from the committee members.
- J. Membership:** Nothing more.
- K. P & A:** The March P & A meeting will be for a training. The CARE Council requested that the committee consider moving the meeting a week earlier to allow time for planning between the P & A and CARE Council meetings.
- L. QMEC:** Lilia Perez reported that the project that they are working on to improve client's health outcomes with the evidence of achieving viral suppression to clients receiving medical case management during the year of 2019. The goal was to increase the viral suppression rate to 90% of those clients, the goal was achieved. Each agency is doing a QIP project and meeting with the county (recipient) on a monthly basis to check the progress. The results: 162 clients were identified at the end of 2018 that weren't virally suppressed, they worked with those clients in 2019. Those clients were receiving case management in 2019 and 60% of the clients achieved viral suppression. They will continue working with QIP projects to help the clients, not only the clients included in the report but in general. This proves how valuable case management services are. It was requested that the report be emailed out to the general membership.
- M. Planning:** Lysette Perez reported that the Planning committee continues to work on the Needs Assessment.
- N. Community Awareness:** None.

**XIII. Announcements:**

David Shamer announced that today was his last meeting CARE Council. He is moving to Broward County.

Compass – March 7 is the 6<sup>th</sup> Annual Red Hat Brunch honoring National Girls and Women HIV Awareness Day.

Monarch Health – March 10 a discussion with female clinicians.

**XIV. Adjournment:** With no further business, the CARE Council Meeting adjourned at 5:17p.m. at the Mayme Frederick Building, 1440 Martin Luther King Jr Blvd, Riviera Beach, FL.

Approved as presented 05/04/2020.sw